Harbetsuvan source verification

The retained Harbetsuvan sources were checked on 28 September 2026. This targeted check does not change the locality-selection date of 12 September 2026 and does not represent a new literature search.

Şen (2022): thesis

The check used the 254-page PDF deposited by the author. It covered the chemical discussion in section 6.6 (printed pp. 120–23), all five tables, all ten graphs, the 78-entry artefact catalogue (pp. 135–60), references and the subsequent maps, photographs, drawings and twenty plates. Tables and graphical material were inspected visually as well as through text extraction.

Table 5 (p. 121) gives minimum, maximum and reported mean percentages for ten major oxides. The text explains that results were averaged by trench, then year and across the three years (p. 122). Graphs 9 and 10 (p. 189) compare aggregate Harbetsuvan values with named source areas. The catalogue gives artefact forms, dimensions, find information, colour and technological descriptions. It does not link individual artefacts to chemical measurements or source assignments. No artefact-level chemical dataset or source-assignment table was identified in the checked PDF.

The thesis proposes several source areas, including Bingöl/Solhan, Nemrut, Acıgöl and Göllü Dağ. These proposals and the plotted geological comparisons do not supply independently checkable assignments for individual archaeological pieces. Graphs 9 and 10 also use different Harbetsuvan summary values: for example, their silica values are 70.93% and 76.48%, respectively. Table 5 gives 76.48% as the reported mean. This check records the discrepancy without recalculating or replacing the published values.

The author-deposited PDF ends at printed p. 231, Plate 20. Its contents list a later biography, which is absent, and some contents-page locators differ from the printed pages. All listed scientific tables, graphs and plates are present. The check establishes what this deposited file contains; it does not certify that every deposited or institutional version is identical.

Şen and Çelik (2022): article

The complete article PDF was checked, including both graphs, all figures, notes and references. The original contents and first article page give a start page of 13; the last article page is 22. The correct reference is therefore *Arkeoloji ve Sanat* 170: 13–22.

The article describes 1778 obsidian finds and their technological and typological composition. Its graphs concern artefact categories and colours. Note 3 (p. 20) refers to major-element XRF results in the thesis, but the article supplies no table of individual chemical measurements or source assignments. The percentage printed on p. 14 for 207 production-debris pieces is inconsistent with the count; pp. 17 and 19 give 11.64%. This does not affect the total assemblage count of 1778 or the selected chemical sample of 177 pieces reported by Şen (2025).

Consequences for the evidence register

The Harbetsuvan analysis remains a published group-level chemical comparison. The thesis and earlier article add technological and contextual information but do not provide individual chemical source assignments. The 177 pieces analysed in the 2025 study are selected production debris, not the entire assemblage or a chemical sample covering every illustrated technological class. Combining source assignments with artefact technology and find context remains necessary to test whether materials from different sources arrived at different stages of reduction.

The check covers the thesis graphs and the complete 2022 article. It verifies what these sources contain; it supplies no new chemical measurements and does not establish that no additional datasets exist elsewhere.

Sources and file identification

- Şen, Z. 2022. *Harbetsuvan Tepesi obsidiyen aletlerin tipolojik ve teknolojik analizleri*. MA thesis, Iğdır University. Author deposit. Checked PDF: 254 pages, 7,703,868 bytes; SHA-256 de1dfebb8177a1ea67e3e3cde4dc83e87614a10732a9093bcfed0292e4759bd2.
- Şen, Z. and Çelik, B. 2022. Çanak Çömleksiz Neolitik Dönem'e ait Harbetsuvan Tepesi obsidyen buluntuları. *Arkeoloji ve Sanat* 170: 13–22. Author record. Checked PDF: 13 pages, including three pages of journal front matter; 581,469 bytes; SHA-256 2c827c4a93a7d81097a719261eaead8a3f4963e03b1732da0509abd3f15d952c.

These identifiers document the copies checked. The source PDFs are not redistributed with this supplementary package.